

**United Nations Group of Experts on Geographical Names**

**5<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Working Group on Exonyms**

**Vienna, Austria, 28<sup>th</sup> March 2006**

Austrian Institute of East and Southeast European Studies,  
1010 Wien, Augustinerstraße 12

**Summary Report**

Agenda:

- 1 Welcome and apologies, adoption of the agenda
- 2 Approval of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting
- 3 Presentation of the revised definitions of *endonym* and *exonym* to the UNGEGN session
- 4 Book on exonyms
- 5 Provision of exonyms for the UN geographical names database project
- 6 Provision of exonyms for the EuroGeoNames database project
- 7 Compilation of lists of exonyms in accordance with past UN resolutions
- 8 Consideration of existing UN resolutions on exonyms and possible new resolutions
- 9 Contributions for the WG website – unaltered since May 2004 and in need of update and maintenance
- 10 Papers on exonyms to be presented at the 23<sup>rd</sup> UNGEGN Session
- 11 Venue and date for the 6<sup>th</sup> Meeting
- 12 Other matters
- 13 Closing of the meeting

(1) Mr. Jordan as the co-convenor opens the meeting at 7 p.m., welcomes the participants and conveys apologies from the convenor of the WG, Mr. Orožen Adamič, who has been appointed Slovenian ambassador in Croatia and is for the reason of urgent business in this context prevented from taking part in the Vienna

meeting. An attendance list is circulated. The agenda is adopted with the inclusion of the additional item 10.

(2) The minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting (Ljubljana, May 2005) are approved.

(3) Definitions: Mr. Jordan recalls that after extended discussions, especially in Prague, new definitions of the terms “endonym” and “exonym” were accepted at the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting in Ljubljana by consensus:

**Endonym** Name of a geographical feature in an official or well-established language occurring in that area where the feature is located.

**Exonym** Name used in a specific language for a geographical feature situated outside the area where that language is spoken, and differing in its form from the name used in an official or well-established language of that area where the geographical feature is located.

However, he also draws attention to a paper (WP 5) to be presented at the 23<sup>rd</sup> Session by Mr. Kadmon, the convenor of the WG on Terminology, in which he criticises the definitions proposed, in particular the term “well-established language”, which in his opinion was open to various interpretations. Mr. Kadmon suggests in his paper alternative definitions. Mr. Jordan asks the audience how the WG should react to this opinion and considers whether to define “well-established language” in the Glossary, perhaps as a language which is at least used by third generation inhabitants and as a teaching language in schools. This raises a discussion on many other points which are unclear in the definitions of “endonym” and “exonym” e.g. names missing diacritics, names differing only by declension, derivation or the translation of a generic term, names phonetically transcribed, different names used in the same language from inside a populated place and from outside, etc. In conclusion, the prevailing opinion is stated that no definition will cover all eventualities; every definition is open to some kind of interpretation; the definitions proposed by the WG are (in contrast to the current definitions in the Glossary) at least exclusive as well as concise and that the WG

should go ahead as agreed at the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting and propose these definitions to the 23<sup>rd</sup> Session.

(4) Book on exonyms: Having distributed an updated list of contributions (see Annex 2), the co-convenor reports that so far 16 contributions to the book have been received and mostly proof-read by Mr. Woodman. Another 3 can be expected, but these must be in his hands by Easter at the latest. Apart from 19 articles the book will also comprise a preface on the aims of the WG, on trends in exonym use, and the views of UNGEGN in this context written by Mr. Woodman, Mr. Orožen Adamič and himself, as well as an extensive bibliography including the most important reference works in the field of exonyms. He (Mr Jordan) will compile this bibliography, but will be grateful for any suggestions and additions from members of the WG. As regards the book's title, consensus is achieved on ***"Exonyms and the International Standardization of Geographical Names. Approaches towards the Resolution of an Apparent Contradiction"***. As regards publication of the book, the co-convenor mentions that in contrast to earlier announcements the publisher of "Wiener Osteuropastudien", the series to host the book, will not now do this free of charge and asks the audience for alternative offers. When no other offers were brought forward he considers the possibility of seeking to cover the expenses by a subsidy from the Austrian Ministry of Education, Sciences and Culture, which can by all probability be obtained.

(5) UN geographical names database project: Ms Kerfoot, UNGEGN Chairperson, reports on the UN database project, which also contains exonyms (to be included under "variant names"). The WG is encouraged to contribute to this project.

(6) EuroGeoNames database project: Mr. Sievers reports on the EuroGeoNames database project, which is also to be furnished with exonyms.

(7) Lists of exonyms: In accordance with past UN resolutions, member countries are encouraged to compile lists of exonyms. It is suggested that the WG provides guidance on production of lists of exonyms and creates a template for national lists of exonyms taking into account the format of existing national lists.

(8) Consideration of existing UN resolutions on exonyms and possible new resolutions: The co-convenor draws attention especially to Resolution III/19, defining the margins of the exonym concept. After some discussion, particularly on the problem of pronunciation exonyms and exonyms within the same language, no intention is expressed at the moment to modify existing resolutions or to draft new resolutions.

(9) WG website (<http://www.zrc-sazu.si/wge>): The WG website is hosted by the Scientific Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and edited by the UK members of the WG. It has, however, not been updated since the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting in Ljubljana. The co-convenor will ask the host institution whether it is ready to maintain this function. He expresses his gratitude to the UK members for their willingness to co-operate further in editing the website and asks all members of the WG to contribute.

(10) Papers on exonyms to be presented at the 23<sup>rd</sup> UNGEGN session: The co-convenor comments on papers on exonyms to be presented at the Session, i.e. WP 5 (*Exonyms, Endonyms and Traditional Names*, Mr Kadmon), WP 9 (*Problems with Standardization of Exonyms in Poland*, Mr. Zych), WP 38 (*The Database of French language exonyms*, Canada), WP 61 (*Historical, Geographical and Legal Validity of the Name Persian Gulf*, Iran), WP 67 (*Report of the Working Group on Exonyms*, Mr Jordan), WP 73 (*Geographical Names as an Editorial Problem*, Mr Stani-Fertl), WP 83 (*List of Czech Exonyms*, Mr Boháč).

(11) Venue and date for the 6<sup>th</sup> Meeting: The WG agreed to hold its next (6<sup>th</sup>) meeting in May or June 2007, well in advance of the 24<sup>th</sup> UNGEGN Session and 9<sup>th</sup> UN Conference 20-31 August 2007, New York. It had been reported at the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting in Ljubljana that this 6<sup>th</sup> meeting will possibly be hosted by either Korea (Republic of) or Greece.

(12) Other matters: The WG members and all experts present congratulate Mr. Orožen Adamič, the convenor, on his honourable appointment and wish Ms. Cheetham all the best for her recovery.

(13) The co-convenor closes the meeting at 8.45 p.m. and thanks all experts for participation.

Peter Jordan  
(Co-convenor)  
19 April 2006

**ANNEX 1****Participants (WG Members are indicated in bold type):**

Beinstein, Bernd, Germany	<a href="mailto:bernd.e.beinstein@bkg.bund.de">bernd.e.beinstein@bkg.bund.de</a>
Bell, Herman, Sudan	<a href="mailto:h.bell@exeter.ac.uk">h.bell@exeter.ac.uk</a>
Bergmann, Hubert, Austria	<a href="mailto:hubert.bergmann@oeaw.ac.at">hubert.bergmann@oeaw.ac.at</a>
<b>Boháč, Pavel</b> , Czech Republic	<a href="mailto:pavel.bohac@cuzk.cz">pavel.bohac@cuzk.cz</a>
<b>Burgess, Caroline</b> , United Kingdom	<a href="mailto:cburgess@pcgn.org.uk">cburgess@pcgn.org.uk</a>
Calvarin, Elisabeth, France	<a href="mailto:elisabeth.calvarin@ign.fr">elisabeth.calvarin@ign.fr</a>
Cekula, Zane, Latvia	<a href="mailto:zane.cekula@lgia.gov.lv">zane.cekula@lgia.gov.lv</a>
Champoux, Gilles, Canada	<a href="mailto:champoux.g5@forces.qc.ca">champoux.g5@forces.qc.ca</a>
Dillon, Leo, United States	<a href="mailto:dillonli@state.gov">dillonli@state.gov</a>
Dutkó, András, Hungary	<a href="mailto:dutko@espolarte.com">dutko@espolarte.com</a>
Ferland, Yaïves, Canada	<a href="mailto:Yaives.Ferland@scg.ulaval.ca">Yaives.Ferland@scg.ulaval.ca</a>
<b>Hausner, Isolde</b> , Austria	<a href="mailto:isolde.hausner@oeaw.ac.at">isolde.hausner@oeaw.ac.at</a>
Helleland, Botolv, Norway	<a href="mailto:botolv.helleland@iln.uio.no">botolv.helleland@iln.uio.no</a>
<b>Jordan, Peter</b> , Austria	<a href="mailto:peter.jordan@osi.ac.at">peter.jordan@osi.ac.at</a>
<b>Kerfoot, Helen</b> , Canada	<a href="mailto:hkerfoot@nrcan.go.ca">hkerfoot@nrcan.go.ca</a>
Kováčová, Mária, Slovakia	<a href="mailto:kovacova@gku.sk">kovacova@gku.sk</a>
Krauze-Tomczyk, Izabella, Poland ksng@gugik.gov.pl	<a href="mailto:izabella.krauze@gugik.gov.pl">izabella.krauze@gugik.gov.pl</a> ;
Lapierre, André, Canada	<a href="mailto:lapierre@uottawa.ca">lapierre@uottawa.ca</a>
Mac Giolla Easpaig, Dónall, Ireland	<a href="mailto:dmacgiolla easpaig@pobail.ie">dmacgiolla easpaig@pobail.ie</a>
<b>Paikkala, Sirkka</b> , Finland	<a href="mailto:sirkka.paikkala@kotus.fi">sirkka.paikkala@kotus.fi</a>

<b>Päll, Peeter</b> , Estonia	<a href="mailto:peeter@eki.ee">peeter@eki.ee</a>
Palmer, Trent C., United States	<a href="mailto:trent.c.palmer@nga.mil">trent.c.palmer@nga.mil</a>
<b>Pokoly, Béla</b> , Hungary	<a href="mailto:bela.pokoly@fvm.hu">bela.pokoly@fvm.hu</a>
<b>Sievers, Jörn</b> , Germany	<a href="mailto:joern.sievers@bkg.bund.de">joern.sievers@bkg.bund.de</a>
<b>Stani-Fertl, Roman</b> , Austria	<a href="mailto:roman.stani-fertl@univie.ac.at">roman.stani-fertl@univie.ac.at</a>
Tatomirović, Slaviša, Serbia and Montenegro	<a href="mailto:vjvgi@beotel.yu">vjvgi@beotel.yu</a>
Trigubov, Mihail, Kyrgyzstan	<a href="mailto:m3g@nm.ru">m3g@nm.ru</a>
Turcotte, Danielle, Canada	<a href="mailto:danielle.turcotte@toponymie.gouv.qc.ca">danielle.turcotte@toponymie.gouv.qc.ca</a>
Viechnicki, Peter D., United States	<a href="mailto:peter.d.viechnicki@nga.mil">peter.d.viechnicki@nga.mil</a>
<b>Wolnicz-Pawlowska, Ewa</b> , Poland	<a href="mailto:ewolnicz@poczta.onet.pl">ewolnicz@poczta.onet.pl</a>
<b>Woodman, Paul</b> , United Kingdom	<a href="mailto:pwoodman@pcgn.org.uk">pwoodman@pcgn.org.uk</a>
Zaccheddu, Pier-Giorgio, Germany	<a href="mailto:pier.zaccheddu@bkg.bund.de">pier.zaccheddu@bkg.bund.de</a>
<b>Zych, Maciej</b> , Poland	<a href="mailto:mzych@uw.edu.pl">mzych@uw.edu.pl</a> ; <a href="mailto:ksng@gugik.gov.pl">ksng@gugik.gov.pl</a>

**ANNEX 2****Book on exonyms: Provisional list of contributions**

(in alphabetical order)

- Boháč, Pavel: THE DISAPPEARANCE OF EXONYMS
- Dragomirescu, Șerban: THE ROMANIAN EXONYMS AFTER 30 YEARS
- Jordan, Peter: CONSIDERATIONS ON THE DEFINITIONS OF "ENDONYM" AND "EXONYM"
- Kadmon, Naftali: THE EXONYM AND THE ENDONYM – ATTEMPTING TO DEFINE THE UNDEFINABLE?
- Kladnik, Drago: TYPES OF EXONYMS IN SLOVENE LANGUAGE
- Matthews, P.W. and Peeter Päll: MĀORI NAMES FOR COUNTRIES ENDONYMS OR EXONYMS?
- “ -: SOME LINGUISTIC ASPECTS OF DEFINING EXONYMS
- N.N.: UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCES ON THE STANDARDIZATION OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES (1967, 1972, 1977, 1982, 1987, 1992, 1998, 2002): TEXTS OF RESOLUTIONS RELEVANT TO THE CONSIDERATION OF EXONYMS
- Ormeling, Ferjan: DUTCH EXONYM STANDARDIZATION
- Orožen Adamič, Milan: EXONYMS AND THE TREATMENT OF GEOGRAPHICAL NAMES IN MULTILINGUAL AREAS
- “ -: THE USE OF EXONYMS IN SLOVENE LANGUAGE WITH SPECIAL ATTENTION ON THE SEA NAMES
- Paikkala, Sirkka: EXONYMS OR ENDONYMS? HOW THE ORTHOGRAPHICAL NORMS OF FOREIGN PLACE NAMES BECAME ESTABLISHED IN FINNISH IN THE 19TH CENTURY
- Pokoly, Béla: FURTHER THOUGHTS ON EXONYMS OF THE HUNGARIAN LANGUAGE
- Raukko, Jarno: A LINGUISTIC CLASSIFICATION OF EXONYMS
- Stani-Fertl, Roman: WHAT IS AN EXONYM? PREMISES AND ELEMENTS OF DEFINITION
- Woodman, Paul: EXONYMS AND UNGEGN: AN UNHAPPY HISTORY
- “ -: EXONYMS: A STRUCTURAL CLASSIFICATION AND A FRESH APPROACH
- “ -: MAN, HIS TERRAIN AND HIS TOPONYMS
- “ -: THE UNGEGN DEFINITIONS OF ENDONYM & EXONYM